A TRANSITION FROM MULTIDISCIPLINARY (PARALLEL) INTEGRATED APPROACH TO TRANSDISCIPLINARY APPROACH IN CURRICULUM OF ISLAMIC EDUCATION

A'zam Mohammadzadeh Ghasr 1, Maghsoud Amin Khandaghi 2*, Morteza Karami 3, Saeed Javad Ghandili 4, Ali Reza Sadeghzadeh Ghamarsi 5

1 Ph.D. Candidate in Curriculum Studies at Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Iran.
2 Corresponding Author, Associate Professor, Department of Curriculum Studies and Instruction, Faculty of Education and Psychology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Iran, aminkhandaghi@ferdowsi.um.ac.ir
3 Associate Professor, Department of Curriculum Studies and Instruction, Faculty of Education and Psychology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Iran.
4 Assistant Professor, Department of Curriculum Studies and Instruction, Faculty of Education and Psychology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Iran.
5 Assistant Professor of Philosophy of Education, Faculty of Humanities, Tarbiat Modares University, Iran.

ABSTRACT

The knowledge of Islamic education is an integration of the educational and Islamic sciences; so it falls into the category of integrated disciplines. Given the diversity of integrated approaches and different application of each approach, it seems vital to identify the situation of the Islamic education curriculum based on integrated approaches to improve the curriculum situation of the discipline. Hence, using descriptive-analytical method (document analysis), the present study seeks to study the integrated approach existent in the curriculum of Islamic education in the postgraduate program so as to explain the desired integrated approach. The research concluded that the integrated approach of the curriculum in the Islamic education discipline in the current situation is a multidisciplinary (parallel) approach and it seems necessary to include the transdisciplinary approach to the integration as an alternative approach for better effectiveness of the Islamic education discipline.

Keywords: transdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, Interdisciplinary, curriculum, discipline of Islamic education.

INTRODUCTION

Interdisciplinary studies are among new and innovative issues in science that are the outcome of the complexity of issues and the non-linear nature of relationships and social relations between different fields of knowledge that makes it impossible to recognize them through disciplinary methods (Taskoh, 2008, 22). The explosion of information and the growing spread of science, the disintegration of various parts of the disciplinary curriculum and its irrelevance to the life plan and social situations are critical problems of the current curriculum, which has greatly intensified the need for integrated programming (Jacobs, 1989).

Briefly, the reasons why those who have noticed the undesired outcomes of discipline-based curriculum adhere to the integrated program include: irrelevance of educational content to the life components outside the educational sphere (Jacobs, 1989: 5-4), incongruity of scientific disciplines to the complexities of multidimensional problems, limitations in research interests, reduced people’s freedom to choose research subjects (Kilbard, 1984; Klein, 2010: 10), knowledge growth and development, fragmentation of existing curricula and negative reaction of society to it (Yakob, 1989), alienation with social concerns and preoccupations, lack of integrity, unity and the real sense of the facts (Kilbard, 1984) and association with learning low levels (Mehr Mohammadi, 2000).

In fact, some experts have suggested the integration methods, namely, the mixture of subjects of study in order to overcome the difficulties and inadequacies of disciplinary approach to the curriculum, where straightforward boundaries between the fields of knowledge are pushed away and learning opportunities are organized in a different way (Yacob, 1989; Morn, 2008; Niculescu, 2010; Klein, 2010; Newell, 2013).

Many experts, on the other hand, have emphasized the role of interdisciplinary studies in the development of humanities. They argue that in recent years, thanks to the complication of societies and the breadth and versatility of issues, the ineffectiveness of the mono disciplinary approach has clearly become apparent, which is one of the most important motives for the spread of interdisciplinary studies (Drake and Bronze, 2004). Hence, with respect to the complicated human nature and, consequently, the complication and width of education, addressing the issues and humanities is outside the scope of a particular discipline thus necessitating the use of an interdisciplinary approach.

Islamic education is an interdisciplinary knowledge that is associated with two realms of “Islamic sciences” and “education”. To comprehend it, background knowledge about Islamic sciences principles and issues from one hand and the knowledge of “education” from the other hand are required. There is no way to meet the needs of the Islamic society unless developing the interdisciplinary knowledge and optimizing the methods used (Samiei, 2012).

The integration of the humanities and Islamic studies in modern history of Iran and Islamic countries has been overlooked, and Islamic studies were considered only as a subdivision of the humanities in academic disciplines1. In recent years and especially in the last three decades, however, abundant efforts have been made to design and present a new model of interdisciplinary studies with the aim of making a meaningful integration between Islamic studies and modern sciences disciplines (Khani, 2010). Contrary to some scholars who believe in the contrast between science and religion, it is proposed in the present study that "science and religion do not contrast." The relationship between science and

1 At some point in the history of science in the Islamic world, and especially in the scientific fields of Shiasm, the ancient sciences have been mixed with new sciences and the output of this integration has been scholars, jurists, commentators, narrators and on the other hand mathematicians, physicians and astronomers like Avicenna and Sheikh Baha’i (Khani, 2010).
Introduction of Islamic education discipline in Iran’s higher education system

Islamic education as an academic discipline started about half a century ago by Muslim thinkers such as Mohammad Qutb in the field of Islamic education. A main turning point, however, occurred in 1397 by Muslim thinkers such as Mohammad Qutb in the field of Islamic education as an academic discipline started about half a century ago. Since then, numerous educational and research centers have been established to cover the scientific and academic discipline of Islamic education, which can be referred to in three categories:

1. Establishment of educational and research centers in the seminary: The Department of educational sciences at the Research Institute of the seminary and university in the seminary was the first center that started in 1982. Afterwards, the Department of educational sciences of Imam Khomeini (RA) Institute was initiated. In recent years, the trend of establishing educational and research centers has grown largely, and now there are more than fourteen non-governmental centers operating.

2. Introduction of the history of philosophy and education with a specialization in education at the master’s and doctoral degrees in several universities.


A search on the website of the Ministry of Science, Research and Technology (www.msrt.ir), reveals the training centers for Islamic education in different educational levels (bachelor, master and doctoral of education program) with following features:

Table (1): Titles of different disciplines in the field of Islamic education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub Group</th>
<th>Educational degree</th>
<th>Title of Discipline</th>
<th>Name of the center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Master and doctorate</td>
<td>History and philosophy of education, Islamic education specialization</td>
<td>State universities (cases²) Department of Islamic education at seminary and university research center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Master and doctorate</td>
<td>History and philosophy of education (Islamic education specialization)</td>
<td>Department of Islamic education at seminary and university research center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>Islamic knowledge and educational sciences</td>
<td>Imam Sadeq (AS) University, women campus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Master</td>
<td>Educational management and planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>Islamic knowledge and educational sciences</td>
<td>Al-Mostafa (SAW) International University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Master</td>
<td>Educational psychology</td>
<td>Department of educational sciences at Imam Khomeini (RA) Educational and Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiqh</td>
<td>Doctorate</td>
<td>Educational Fiqh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quran sciences</td>
<td>Doctorate</td>
<td>Quran sciences (education specialization)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>Educational sciences and Islamic knowledge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational sciences</td>
<td>Master</td>
<td>Religious education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Values education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Curriculum and educational planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Doctorate</td>
<td>Psychology of Islamic education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Educational psychology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Allameh Tabataba’ee University, Shahid Bahonar University of Kerman, Shahed University, Tarbiat Modares University, Shiraz University, Malayer university

Introduction of Islamic education discipline in Iran’s higher education system

Since there are different kinds of integrated approaches, each with different advantages, disadvantages and applications, the present study tends to introduce different types of integrated approaches and examine the situation of Islamic education based on different integrated approaches in order to determine the optimal integrated approach in the curriculum of Islamic education. After identifying the integrated approach of the intended discipline, the fitness of the integrated approach in the discipline curriculum will be examined for feasibility of the discipline persistency as well as its effectiveness and further development. In other words, since the Islamic education discipline is an integration of two disciplines of Islamic sciences and educational sciences, the present study seeks to identify the integrated approach to the curriculum planning intended for Islamic education discipline in the state’s higher education. The present study specifically asks the following questions: which integrated approach does the intended curriculum for Islamic education discipline in the postgraduate program fit most? In other words, based on which integrated approach the intended curriculum of Islamic education in the postgraduate program has been developed? And is the integrated approach to Islamic education effective enough? If not, what is an alternative integrated approach to Islamic education?

Introduction of Islamic education discipline in Iran’s higher education system

Since there are different kinds of integrated approaches, each with different advantages, disadvantages and applications, the present study tends to introduce different types of integrated approaches and examine the situation of Islamic education based on different integrated approaches in order to determine the optimal integrated approach in the curriculum of Islamic education. After identifying the integrated approach of the intended discipline, the fitness of the integrated approach in the discipline curriculum will be examined for feasibility of the discipline persistency as well as its effectiveness and further development. In other words, since the Islamic education discipline is an integration of two disciplines of Islamic sciences and educational sciences, the present study seeks to identify the integrated approach to the curriculum planning intended for Islamic education discipline in the state’s higher education. The present study specifically asks the following questions: which integrated approach does the intended curriculum for Islamic education discipline in the postgraduate program fit most? In other words, based on which integrated approach the intended curriculum of Islamic education in the postgraduate program has been developed? And is the integrated approach to Islamic education effective enough? If not, what is an alternative integrated approach to Islamic education?

Introduction of Islamic education discipline in Iran’s higher education system

Since there are different kinds of integrated approaches, each with different advantages, disadvantages and applications, the present study tends to introduce different types of integrated approaches and examine the situation of Islamic education based on different integrated approaches in order to determine the optimal integrated approach in the curriculum of Islamic education. After identifying the integrated approach of the intended discipline, the fitness of the integrated approach in the discipline curriculum will be examined for feasibility of the discipline persistency as well as its effectiveness and further development. In other words, since the Islamic education discipline is an integration of two disciplines of Islamic sciences and educational sciences, the present study seeks to identify the integrated approach to the curriculum planning intended for Islamic education discipline in the state’s higher education. The present study specifically asks the following questions: which integrated approach does the intended curriculum for Islamic education discipline in the postgraduate program fit most? In other words, based on which integrated approach the intended curriculum of Islamic education in the postgraduate program has been developed? And is the integrated approach to Islamic education effective enough? If not, what is an alternative integrated approach to Islamic education?

Introduction of Islamic education discipline in Iran’s higher education system

Since there are different kinds of integrated approaches, each with different advantages, disadvantages and applications, the present study tends to introduce different types of integrated approaches and examine the situation of Islamic education based on different integrated approaches in order to determine the optimal integrated approach in the curriculum of Islamic education. After identifying the integrated approach of the intended discipline, the fitness of the integrated approach in the discipline curriculum will be examined for feasibility of the discipline persistency as well as its effectiveness and further development. In other words, since the Islamic education discipline is an integration of two disciplines of Islamic sciences and educational sciences, the present study seeks to identify the integrated approach to the curriculum planning intended for Islamic education discipline in the state’s higher education. The present study specifically asks the following questions: which integrated approach does the intended curriculum for Islamic education discipline in the postgraduate program fit most? In other words, based on which integrated approach the intended curriculum of Islamic education in the postgraduate program has been developed? And is the integrated approach to Islamic education effective enough? If not, what is an alternative integrated approach to Islamic education?
Curriculum of religious education discipline
The titles and number of courses in religious education discipline are given in Table (2).

Table (2): Titles and number of courses in religious education discipline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Religious psychology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Religious studies from the perspective of Islam and other principal religions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kalam (1)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>psychometrics</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Religious education in Quran and tradition</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kalam (2)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Inferential statistics</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>The educational trend of great educators in the field of religious education</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Epistemology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>A comparative study of religious education in religions</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Religious developmental psychology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ego debates (philosophical anthropology)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Research methodology in education (advanced experimental methods)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>A comparative study of religious education in the educational systems of the Islamic countries of the world</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Basics and methods of research in Quran and Hadith (1)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>History of religious education in Islam and Iran</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Philosophy of religious education</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Basics and methods of research in Quran and Hadith (2)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Seminar on religious education issues</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Total units</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Comparative anthropology</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sociology of religious education</td>
<td>Prerequisites</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Total units</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Values education</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>Lesson</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Developmental psychology</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Taken from the general specifications, program and topics of the master’s degree courses in the field of educational sciences, religious education orientation, approved by the seven hundred and seventh session of the Higher Education Planning Council, 2008.

Features of faculty members in the field of religious education
Faculty members of religious education discipline at Imam Khomeini (RA) Educational and Research Institute includes three assistant professors with a doctorate degree in educational psychology and seminary specialization of Kharif Fiqh and Usul, three assistant professors with a doctoral degree in philosophy of education and seminary specialization of Kharif Fiqh and Usul, and one instructor with a master’s degree in educational sciences and seminary specialization of Kharif Fiqh and Usul.

Interdisciplinary theoretical and research foundations in the higher education
Interdisciplinary collaboration in interdisciplinary literature has been defined and categorized under different headings (Moran, 2008: 2). And Nicolescu has called it the war of definitions (Nicolescu, 2010). Chandra Mohan believes that the interdisciplinary collaboration is not a new concept but it originates in Plato’s ideal of unity (Yacob, 1989: 25). However, according to Beane (1997), the history of integrated curriculum dates back to earlier than the 1950s. The background of interdisciplinary issue indicates that many experts such as Latulka (2001), Klein (1990), Kockelmans (1979), Newell (1998), Nikitina (2006), Boden (1997), Miller (1998), Lennoir & et al. (2000), Gibbons & et al. (1994), Aram (2004), Lenhard et al. (2006), Davies & Dunnill (2006), Max-Neef (2005), Johansen & Hjølstrand (2008) and Huutoniemi & et al. (2010) have proposed different conceptual classifications. And they have distinguished between such concepts as intra-disciplinary, cross-disciplinary, inter-disciplinary, relational inter-disciplinary exchange, interdisciplinary, pluridisciplinary, multi-disciplinary, pluri-disciplinary, trans-disciplinary, parallel trans-disciplinary post-disciplinary.

Different forms of interdisciplinary collaboration have been proposed while no straightforward distinction has been drawn among them and no precise definition has been made. To put an end to the interdisciplinary challenges, Klein (1990) and Newell (2013), have devised interdisciplinary dialogue and collaboration under the umbrella of pluridisciplinary. Pluridisciplinary concept refers to any form of disciplinary collaboration depending on the level, type, and purpose of the discipline. It is premised on the notion that disciplinary collaboration is a pluralized idea; this notion is organized in a heterogeneous set of forms and activities that are changing the way we think about knowledge and education. According to Klein (2010), these forms and activities rest in a continuum from work communications and indirect networks to new and emerging areas. In this sense, the pluridisciplinary emerges in the form of multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary, and transdisciplinary approaches. In this approach, the disciplines do not go with each other, but they mutually influence and affect each other (Shabani Varaki, Babadi, 2014).

Interdisciplinarity can be considered a dual concept. The first concept is “theoretical” and is used as a discourse in academic education and research and has different types. The second concept is “pragmatic” and is considered a specific and definite type. So in the second sense, “interdisciplinarity” is a subset of the more general title of “interdisciplinary” with only a verbal affinity. In other words, in the first concept, interdisciplinary is an umbrella that includes other types of collaboration among disciplines (Taskoh, 2008: 61). Based on the interaction, collaboration level, and convergent interdisciplinary composition, Klein (1990) has identified three main types of multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary, and transdisciplinary as the taxonomy of Interdisciplinarity. In addition to Klein (1990), McGregor (2009), Drake (1993), and Mam (2002) also have identified three multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary, and transdisciplinary types as the main types of interdisciplinarity.

In fact, a convergent composition is the main point we are seeking for in the interdisciplinarity (Kazans, 2001: 78). Interdisciplinarity researcher seeks to generate a new product through collaboration and
interaction of other disciplines and creating convergence and integration among them. Now this combination and interaction can be partial and limited or complete and unlimited. This spectrum of composition creates a "multidisciplinary" to "transdisciplinary" scope. Therefore, it can be said that in the multidisciplinarity, composition and convergence are in their lowest level and the interdisciplinary interaction and collaboration is more limited; In the interdisciplinarity, we see a relatively good interaction and combination between disciplines, and in the transdisciplinarity, this interaction and collaboration is maximized going beyond the science borders such that a problem is solved without the need to be restricted to a particular discipline in line with the disciplines perspectives. Studies carried out in the field of integration indicate the presentation of a variety of approaches that have created different patterns and forms, each with particular capabilities, and a glance at experts’ views in this field clarifies that the variation of concepts and types of integration forms marks the theoretical complexities and challenges that follow integration issues (Mehr Mohammadi, 1998). The taxonomy in this study is based on the interaction, collaboration level and convergent composition criteria, which are defined as follows.

**Multidisciplinarity**

Multidisciplinarity is known as contiguity of several different disciplines (Chettiparamb, 2007) in a way that a number of disciplines simultaneously study a single subject (Nicolescu, 2010). In such an approach, each subject is ultimately combined with the views of several disciplines, and the disciplines are put together in an encyclopedic article style, that are in harmony with each other (Klein, 2004, Rege Coket, 2009; Augsburg, 2005; Klein, 1996). Teachers in multidisciplinarity present a subject or content through several areas of content. In this way, although each discipline deals with the subject or content separately from its own perspective of content area, it facilitates the integration process by the student. At this point of integration, the focus is on the content of the disciplines; but the content of the chosen theme or subject is revised and adapted (Burns, 1995). This curriculum, also called a parallel disciplinary or parallel multidisciplinary approach, is created by juxtaposing related subjects of study. In fact, with contribution of the experts in various disciplines, while maintaining their epistemological and methodical identity in practice, we can only see a balanced implementation of lessons in two or more disciplines where the logical order of each discipline is observed (Augsburg, 2005). Thus there will be no convergence and interaction between two or more epistemological disciplines in terms of subject, principles or method. Although in a multidisciplinary approach, a simple approach with no integrated features is required, compared to other approaches, it should not be neglected that all non-disciplinary educational processes, especially in the first step, and as long as there is no determined educational texts and content or sufficient professors are required to apply the multidisciplinary (parallel) approach as the most minimal and the first move in the integrated path. One of the most important challenges of this type of integration is the ambiguity in the student’s mind as a result of the lack of deep and effective relationship between disciplines and concepts; except for some students who have had previous background, most students hardly understand the relations between concepts and it is likely to push the learners to the opposite direction of educational goals. According to Nicolescu (2010), interdisciplinarity refers to the transfer of methods from one discipline to another. Like multidisciplinarity, interdisciplinarity overflows the disciplines, but its goal still remains within the framework of disciplinary research. Interdisciplinarity even has the capacity of generating new disciplines.

**Inter-disciplinarity**

In this type, two or more disciplines interact with each other. Experts in various fields of knowledge have entered the epistemological and methodological boundaries of each other purposefully, dynamically and actively to solve a problem or understand a multifaceted phenomenon better, and act according to the necessities and needs to expand the fields of knowledge and create new scientific structures. (Weber, 1978).
curricula in the epistemology, which has led to the alignment of at least two spectrums of unitarian and pluralistic theories. The unitarian theories are intertwined with the integrated program, but pluralistic theories have implications for disciplinary and subject-oriented programs. Unlike pluralistic epistemological theories at the opposite pole, which includes a range of unitarian epistemological theories, philosophical foundations can be found to support the integration of curricula (Alam al-Huda, 2002).

Interdisciplinary evaluation indicators based on different integration types

A review of the literature showed that most of the articles and books have been published in the area of interdisciplinary generalities, principles and various types (Masumi et al., 2010). Issues specific to interdisciplinarity assessment based on certain indicators in different interdisciplinary areas have been neglected by experts. Indicators are of particular importance for the continuous evaluation of interdisciplinary quality in terms of designing, engineering and implementation. The inadequacy of disciplinary study indicators to evaluate the quality of interdisciplinary studies that transcends restricted boundaries has necessitated designing and developing specific indicators for interdisciplinary studies (Klein, 1990).

A review of the literature in this area showed that some research such as university interdisciplinary quality assessment indicators; a tool for planning (Mehr Mohammadi and Kizuri, 2010); Interdisciplinary studies and academic teaching from curriculum planning to educational planning (Rege Colet, 2000); how to evaluate interdisciplinary curriculum (Bazargan, 2009) and valid indicators for interdisciplinary studies in general education (American Association for Integrative Studies, 2000) have designed and developed interdisciplinary indicators at the theoretical level, but no research on interdisciplinary evaluation has been carried out practically.

Interdisciplinary indicators can be obtained based on the composition and interaction of the domains and their four components. The type and combination level of the above factors, their level of participation and the role of participants, the focus on academic or social issues in the formation of interdisciplinarity constitute different indicators, each of which is expounded below. (Khorasandi Taskoh, 2008).

Vertical / horizontal indicator: This index refers to the type of participation or collaboration of specialists.

Vertical: The level of collaboration of participants in different concepts and methods is "unequal" and "uneven". The quality of this method depends on the role of the participants and the quality of the theory they use.

Horizontal: The level of collaboration of participants in different concepts and methods is "equal" and "even". A particular discipline is superior to other disciplines in terms of experiences and methods.

Broad / Deep indicator: refers to the fields or disciplines involved in the integration from the perspective of epistemological or methodological bases.

Broad: There is a cognitive unity between different fields or disciplines such as natural sciences, humanities, social sciences, etc. to achieve a shared goal such as transdisciplinary and multidisciplinary models.

Deep: The specialized integration of elements, methods, and teaching resources for a particular course at the classroom level such as intradisciplinary and crossdisciplinary models.

Open / Closed indicator: refers to the areas or disciplines of the participant in the integration in terms of similarity or dissimilarity of epistemological foundations.

Open: Different scientific fields work together with different paradigms and epistemological and methodological orientations, like intermix of disciplines from the realms of natural sciences and engineering.

Closed: The disciplines of different fields that are similar in terms of basics and epistemology and are included in a single domain in terms of specialization are combined with each other like combination of different disciplines in the realm of natural sciences.

Educational / research indicator: Study of integration from the perspective of the problem necessity, the needs of the community or pervasive interests.

Educational: In the educational indicator, a comprehensive, symmetrical and integrated view to the interests and needs of learners on the one hand and the expectations, requirements and demands of society on the other hand are considered in the integration of disciplines.

Research: Depending on the requirements, necessities and level of complexity of the problem and subject, the epistemological and methodological capacities and experiences of different disciplines can be used.

Pragmatic / Critical Indicator: The approach to solving social, cultural, political and economic problems of society in terms of fundamental or radical change contradicts the conservative approach.

Pragmatic (instrumental or situational): Focuses on social, economic, political, and cultural issues. This indicator associates with the conservative integrations.

Critical: It proceeds based on the analysis and critique of existing epistemological, social, cultural and political structures. This indicator is related to reflective, deconstructive and radical combinations. Except for the transdisciplinary, most types rest in the realm of the pragmatic indicator.

Integration aspects: disciplines can be integrated from the knowledge (epistemology), method and skill aspects. A methodological integration, for example, can be found in the discipline of "music physics" where the music discipline is studied from methodological and instrumental perspective for the physics discipline.

Integration Focus: the establishment of an interdisciplinarity can be based on the development of a scientific discipline, solving a social problem (obesity problem) / academic (priming) or a specific subject (learning). For example, women studies have been conducted to address women’s social and cultural issues and problems.

Integration result: Depending on the purpose of disciplines integration to be solving immediate and social / academic problems or to create knowledge, the result of integration may or may not lead to the creation of a new discipline. Integration in such types as interdisciplinary and crossdisciplinary leads to a new discipline, but the types such as multidisciplinary and parallel do not end in a new discipline.

Specialists’ collaboration: The need for the presence of a specialist in specialized disciplines in disciplines integration and interdisciplinarity initiation sessions.

Disciplines participation rate: Independence or dependence of disciplines in interdisciplinary integration. In types such as multidisciplinary and pluridisciplinary, the independence of disciplines is maintained in collaboration with integration projects, but in types such as interdisciplinary, disciplines may lose their independence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table (4): Interdisciplinary evaluation indicators in different types</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Experts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

861
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Unit of Analysis</th>
<th>Collaboration</th>
<th>Scope</th>
<th>Focus</th>
<th>Research Type</th>
<th>Integration</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khorsandi Taskoh (2008), Roland (2008), Allen and Gage (1998)</td>
<td>Integration</td>
<td>Necessity of specialists collaboration</td>
<td>Open/closed</td>
<td>Broad</td>
<td>Horizontal</td>
<td>Disciplines participation with average integration of disciplines</td>
<td>Pragmatic</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

Document analysis method was used to identify the integrated situation of Islamic education in the educational system of the country. Thus, the written document of the curriculum of an Islamic education discipline titled as “Religious education” from Educational Sciences department of Imam Khomeini (RA) Educational and Research Institute was examined and analyzed with respect to interdisciplinary evaluation indicators. The document analysis procedure was performed based on the steps mentioned by O’Leary (2014), which are as follows:

1. Collecting the relevant texts (documents)
2. Refining and organizing the documents and creating a framework
3. Preparing copies of the documents for taking notes
4. Examining the authenticity of the documents
5. Determining the subject matter and the agenda of each document
6. Searching the background and the context of the subject matter discussed in the documents
7. Making questions with relation to the document (for example, who has produced it? Why? When? Type of data?)
8. Exploring the content of the document.

The document content analysis unit in this research is a written curriculum of religious education discipline. The unit of analysis is a particular part of the content that is being analyzed. The registration unit is "a part of the text that the researcher records at the time of studying whenever he or she encounters it, depending on his goal." The registration unit in this research is the topics and sources of each course. Background Unit: It is not possible to classify the registration unit without pointing to the field in which that unit appears. Therefore, it is necessary to refer to a part of the text and record the intended information based on its content. The field of content in this research is the courses or lesson units for which topics has been developed and the sources for its content have been introduced. The reliability of documents means that reliable documents are authentic; that is, documents that have been written according to temporal and spatial conditions mentioned in the text and have been signed by a person or persons who have the authority to do so (Duranti, 2009), the validity of the documents in this research has been evaluated from four aspects of reliability, authenticity, accuracy and validation. Validity is the reliability of the document's content, that is estimated based on the completeness of the document, i.e. all the apparent elements of the document that is required by the administrative system.

Authenticity, an authentic document is a document that has not been manipulated or distorted and has the same identity (such as the name of the author of the document and its audience, date of compilation, title, registration number) of the time it was first created while its accuracy has been also preserved over time.

Accuracy is the reliability of data in any document and includes completeness (speech conformity with the fact), exactness (completeness and accuracy), precision (firmness, unambiguity), or completeness, and is usually presumed for documents with authenticity and validity.
Table 5: (5) Multi-disciplinary (parallel) type indicators in religious education discipline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Result</th>
<th>Specialist collaboration</th>
<th>Open</th>
<th>Broad</th>
<th>Horizontal</th>
<th>Vertical</th>
<th>Integration disciplines participation</th>
<th>Pragmatic</th>
<th>Research</th>
<th>Disciplines maintain independency and don't integrate</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No integration</td>
<td>Specialists collaboration is not necessary</td>
<td>Open</td>
<td>Broad</td>
<td>Horizontal</td>
<td>Vertical</td>
<td>Disciplines participation without integration with maintaining disciplines realm</td>
<td>Pragmatic</td>
<td>Research</td>
<td>Disciplines maintain independency and don't integrate</td>
<td>Religious education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With respect to the interdisciplinary indicators (Table 4), the topics are consistent with horizontal, broad, open, and open indicators; because the juxtaposition of topics relevant to the fields of educational sciences and Islamic studies is equal and matched, with no experience and method of one particular discipline surpassing the others. It is broad because the unity of cognition across different fields or disciplines has been taken into account. It is open because the educational sciences and Islamic studies collaborate in a specialized way in different scientific fields despite different paradigms and epistemological and methodological orientations.

As for the course topics, it can be said that most of the topics are not at the integration level with respect to the titles of topics stipulated below each topic; because the effect and basis of the component disciplines are clearly apparent. For example, in the topic of research methodology in education, only the topics related to experimental methods have been argued and the methodology of Islamic research has not been discussed. In some topics such as "religious education in the Holy Quran and Tradition" and "sociology of religious education", however, a subtle transition towards the crossdisciplinarity of the mentioned discipline can be inferred. The rest of the topics and titles of the courses are divided into two sections of seminary courses (Islamic studies) and common educational sciences (based on findings of experimental sciences). In other words, in the current structure of the Islamic education discipline, conventional education courses (personality psychology, developmental psychology, etc.) are taught without any fundamental changes and with the translation of books on education and psychology, besides the fact that Islamic studies issues have been added to the curriculum in the form of several courses completely independent of the usual courses. With respect to the interdisciplinary indicators, it seems that the religious education discipline has been designed in the current situation based on the multidisciplinary (parallel) type.

**Alternative approach in Islamic education curriculum**

In a parallel integrated curriculum, from among the three main elements of education, i.e. the course source, the teacher and the student, only the student element is focussed; in other words, in parallel courses topics are not integrated and teachers are not necessarily responsible for presenting integrated issues. And it is only the learner that has to try to communicate with both areas of knowledge by acquiring them, and this means that the student has the grave responsibility of establishing a link between conventional educational sciences and Islamic sciences and production of the sciences of Islamic education. The parallel approach seems insufficient in leading to the development and improvement of the Islamic education discipline. Therefore, an alternative approach in interdisciplinary types needs to be explored. For this purpose, the characteristics and indicators of interdisciplinary fields were considered and the alternative approach in the curriculum of Islamic education was identified.

In the transdisciplinarity, relations in basic issues in any discipline are shared and discussed with any other discipline, and a kind of promotional dialectic is established between these issues and relationships, whereby new concepts and issues and transdisciplinarity are procured, that has a kind of command over previous issues and data, while indicative of the issues of the previous disciplines, such issues also indicate a new kind of reality that arises from the disappearance of the existing boundaries between the disciplines and the sciences in question and yet no integration of them. In fact, this is due to a special view in transdisciplinarity that is running with the aim of knowing the truth, nature and knowledge in a certain direction according to the type of content of the sciences in question.

In this method, the specific disciplinary constraints related to the specific content and its meticulous objective are eliminated. This method, on the other hand, can be considered a disciplinary promoting factor from two aspects. From content aspect, that is holistic with the approach of knowing the truth, this method is an improving factor in education and the change of educational content in curriculum planning. From methodological aspect, with respect to the non-integration approach while blurring disciplinary borders, it leads to the change of limited research methods and the use of further research tools and a more comprehensive view to research and the replacement of broader and comparative methods.

The transdisciplinarity ideal is to attain truth in such a way that the content of other sciences is shared whereby new results and outcomes can be achieved in line with that elevated goal. But in the approach taken in other sciences, such a goal is not intended and what is considered as a presumed and certain principle in sciences with transdisciplinary approach needs to be explored and analyzed in order to lead the content of other sciences to reach a truth which is rooted in man and man’s intuition of “escape from nothingness” and “tendancy to existence and existential resources.” With this view, the ideal of science can be set to a higher goal and by contemplating on and analyzing the presuppositions of science their content can be extended ontologically. It is under this view that the basic sciences (physics, chemistry, etc.), engineering, medicine, etc. can lead to the transformation in the system of existence by considering education as the main goal in their specialized fields. And in this point it can be said that education beyond the boundaries of disciplines tends to the unity of knowledge.

**CONCLUSION**

This paper examined different patterns and types of integrated curricula and also explained their fitness in the Islamic education discipline as a new discipline in Iran's higher education system. In fact, while elaborating the integrated approaches, it answered the following questions: based on which integrated approach has the curriculum of the intended course of Islamic education in the postgraduate program
been developed? And is the integrated approach to Islamic education appropriate for effectiveness?

The findings of this study show that the integrated approach governing the curriculum of Islamic education discipline is a content-oriented approach in terms of the titles of the courses and topics. From among the content-oriented types, the parallel approach has been selected as the basis for developing a course curriculum. However, due to the weak points of the approach and the superiority of content development over other issues, it cannot fit the Islamic education courses; hence it is necessary for these institutions to change their curriculum from a parallel approach to a more efficient integrated approach.

Given that the Islamic education discipline is included in the multidisciplinarity, it cannot be expected to suddenly emerge as a transdisciplinary, but it needs to continue to follow the existing disciplinary collaborative systems, with respect to the requirements and obligations of multidisciplinarity. Then it can emerge as a transdisciplinary. What is clear is that "multidisciplinary work" does not guarantee the integration, convergence, and communicative interaction between scientific disciplines, so it is necessary to overpass this approach and move toward more integrated approaches.

Interdisciplinary studies, and consequently transdisciplinary studies, are moving from the field, goals and objectives to the realm of practices and applications. However, transdisciplinarity in the field of curriculum, teaching, and learning in the higher education involves a range of institutional adjustments and adaptations that are not easily adaptable to current frameworks. Given that most of the existing academic and seminary institutions are still confined to scientific and specialized disciplines and areas, the challenge of the transdisciplinary curriculum often is overcoming the mismatch between the level of interest of educational institutions and the social interests in establishing transdisciplinarity on the one hand and the readiness to undertake changes in organizational structures on the other hand. This requires the development and strengthening of theoretical and practical infrastructure in the academic field at the same time. However, the objectification of the transdisciplinary studies in the curriculum area and its transfer from design to action stage is difficult. It is difficult to transfer and extend the transdisciplinary principles to the university curriculum, and Rege Colet (2009: 293) addresses these difficulties with some basic points. 1- Strict disciplinarily of academic space, involves resistance to change in the method of handling the structural organization. 2- The distance between the level of curriculum planning and educational planning (practical action in the field of teaching). 3. Lack of conceptual and epistemological referential framework and lack of clear rational form and its weak modeling in the field of academic teaching. And 4 The shortcomings in the training courses of university teachers. These are four obstacles to the development of the transdisciplinary curriculum.

REFERENCES


